3.5 Northern soul and the city of surrogation

Edward Marsden[1]

✕ ~~Abstract~~

This paper demonstrates the potential of applying visual ethnography and netnography to (ethno?)musicological[2] analysis of sound cultures online. The cyberculture of Northern Soul and The Twisted Wheel club are used as a case study to examine DIY archival practices and remix, hacker culture on social media. Using Instagram as a research location I explore Northern Soul and its members who embrace DIY methods and networking architecture as a response to hegemonic forces. Algorithms are presented as a force of power that are shaping the sound culture as its members attempt to stay connected yet avoid mainstream control. By incorporating Joseph Roach's concept of surrogation, I suggest a narrative for archival practices whilst also connecting Northern Soul within black Atlantic literature. In doing so, the malleable properties of time, space, and identity are explored within the digital city of Instagram.

Keywords: Northern Soul, DIY, social media.

1. Introduction

During 2020 while I was reflecting upon the data I had gathered during my dissertation, I found myself, like others in a state of perpetual cabin fever as the global pandemic created limitations and barriers that inhibited life as we know it. Fortunately, the internet provided a means of escaping space and binding offline worlds with digital environments. Increasingly, I found myself seamlessly connecting with friends and family, as well as data participants in their respective digital abodes, which underlined the symbiotic nature many of us share with digital technology. I noticed abundant forms of digital communication that involved hacking nostalgia, zeitgeists, and utopia to create meaning and escape from the present. In this 'Dali-esque' digital scape of GIF's and memes, I became a bricoleur, remixing time, space, and memories into collages of expression and absorbing music across social media platforms to fill cavities of loss. Ultimately, this form of communication which was embedded in a myriad of platforms across many demographics presented me with an alternative notion of what social media usage is.

1.1. Social media

This activity is more than a moment of self-reflection; alternatively, it is a rumination of Northern Soul culture online. Northern Soul is increasingly being examined from a range of diverse perspectives; however, social media is still overlooked not only as a research location but also with regards to the activity that occurs on platforms. Although Sarah Raine and Tim Wall observe "one of the most striking aspects of the contemporary northern soul scene is how much of its communal activity takes place online" (Raine & Wall, 2019, pp. 157-159) social media is widely overlooked within academic analysis of Northern Soul. My analysis of this communal activity for the purposes of this paper makes two distinctions in the cyber milieu.

. . . .

1. University of Birmingham, United Kingdom. E-mail: ejm484@student.bham.ac.uk

2. This label is used throughout as a reference to current debates within (ethno?)musicology surrounding the disciplines name.

Firstly, Northern Soul *offline* practices of selling/buying records, promotion of events and knowledge sharing are prominent on Facebook, Instagram, and YouTube as well as dedicated sites such as SoulSource. The dedication of members[3] is reflected in the quality of edited footage, montages, and flyers with DIY professionalism alongside grassroots participation. In fact, the internet appears to have been effortlessly adopted to pursue DIY practices already present. Secondly, alongside these habits members also use social media to share *memories* which form the examination of this paper. Members serve as curators as they upload memories of the past in the form of images, flyers, posters, and memorabilia alongside a mesmerizing array of contemporary material (Raine & Wall, 2017, p. 76). Subsequently, the discussions created via documented audio-visual items from the past and present provide cohesive elements for bonding and networking whilst the digital environment also provides a space between events that sustains the essence of Northern Soul. Social media also provides a medium to *instantly* archive memories and images; consequently, it is with images, the tangible form of memories that I focused my attention, along with the question of how does (ethno?)musicology as a discipline embrace digital environments and big data?

1.2. Visual ethnography

My qualitative data collection relied on Instagram as a research location as it is a social media site that has historically prioritised imagery. Robert Kozinets netnography (see Kozinets, 2019) which can be understood as ethnography for the digital sphere, was also chosen to underpin my methodology, due to the solutions it provides for new challenges in online research. My outlying aim as I constructed my methodology was to reflect the architecture of Instagram and gather vast amounts of data related to the images. Consequently, my visual ethnography matrix comprised seven elements including, type, time, emotion, narrative, likes and views, themes, and hashtags. This was achieved using grounded theory, which was chosen to accommodate the extensive data gathered. I applied inductive and deductive reasoning as I aimed to simultaneously install theoretical concepts, as well as respond to the organic nature of documenting new data as it occurred. This paper focuses on one of these matrix elements; hashtags, which was constructed using inductive reasoning and which comprised a small segment of this data collection.

My sample of 12 Northern Soul members was justified based on Guest, Bunce and Johnsons' (2006) study into qualitative interviews which suggests that data saturation occurs at 12 interviews. The users consisting of 6 men and 6 women from Europe, North America, and Asia, were chosen for having a highly dedicated account revolving around Northern Soul. From this sample 100 images from each user were chosen with the resulting 1200 images consisting of varying hashtags and motivations. Theoretical data saturation a priori was challenging as there is disagreement at which point this occurs in qualitative data collection studies (see Fusch & Ness, 2015). However, delving into Instagram methodically allowed me an insight as to what is occurring across varying demographics and geographical regions. Moreover, the use of hashtags within images presented a method for participants to capture ideologies, artists, memories, places, and time as they amalgamated an assortment of hashtags within textual discussions and images within the archive of Instagram. The following discussion provides an overview of my findings with a specific focus on the relationship between hashtags, images, and DIY archival practices.

2. Archival and DIY culture or remix and hacker culture?

Archival culture is rarely applied to Northern Soul; however, Sarah Thornton (1995) refers to Northern Soul as "Perhaps the first fully-fledged *archival* dance culture to draw attention to the distinct potentials of discs over and above performed music" (Thornton, 1995, p. 111). The archival nature of records that Thornton refers to is perhaps the cornerstone of not only the sound culture itself but also its desire to collect and archive. Although Northern Soul started in the UK in the 1970s, its rare records from 1960s and 1970s black America were famously collected by crate diggers and vinyl connoisseurs that sought non-commercial Soul music. The records enabled a unique sound culture to form which extended to clubs, promoters, collectors, DJs, and dancers all contributing their DIY adroit. In tandem, collections of badges that were specific to each club visited became a unique archival activity whilst memorabilia in the form of flyers, images, and magazines, were in retrospect also archived privately. The rarity of the records was deeply intertwined with the practise

3. The term members and followers used instead of 'fans' to disengage with the connotation of fandom.

of covering up records, thus deepening exclusivity which is reflected in hashtags such as #OVO (original vinyl only). Although bootlegging occurred it still fuelled the demand for the original and with the quest for the collection of records came the archive of knowledge regarding the covered-up artists, labels, and history behind the records.

DIY is also rarely used in reference to Northern Soul, however, Sarah Raine and Tim Wall note "its culture and economy demonstrates a central DIY ethic, with the key practices and busy event schedule under the direct control of its participants" (Raine & Wall, 2017, p. 76). By utilising Blues & Soul Magazine to examine myths within the sound culture they suggest a process of 'self-documentation' which involves members assembling a DIY history assorted from memories and stories in the form of "pictures and scans of physical objects, such as ticket stubs or membership books" (Raine & Wall, 2019, p. 158). As I have mentioned, member led DIY archival practices have become an effortless extension of the DIY practicalities of Northern Soul. In fact, these practices exist because of the underground nature that is engrained within Northern Soul, whilst simultaneously, the sound culture rejects outside influence or control in favour of its own structuring. In opposition to mainstream input (see Raine & Wall, 2017, p. 76), DIY archiving has also occurred with members collecting their memories in ever expanding self-produced literature collected from a rich history of oral culture steeped in myths and insider memories that form the folklore and archives of the sound culture.

This paper suggests remix and hacker culture are complimentary, viable, theoretical frameworks to consider as they allow the reinvention of style, imagery, music, and their correlating images and hashtags to be reflected upon as meaningful and active endeavours (Vito, 2014). Lawrence Lessig's (2008) reflection on the issue of copyright and balance of power between top-down business models and its consumers is also noteworthy in its application of Northern Soul listening practices. Similarly, hacker culture is another theoretical framework that allows researchers to not only examine cyberculture and the connection to images and hashtags, but also offline non-computer mediated activities such as records. Baptiste Bacot and Clément Canonne's (2019) scrutiny of hacking in music cultures observes this possibility with the "material or symbolic, technical or legal fence, which contains something like a black box" whose opening is deemed negative with the act of appropriation whereas its alteration and duplication is perceived as positive. "The peculiarity of the hack" (and indeed Northern Soul's use of records) "is therefore first to be sought in this operative duality: breaking to repair, crochet to diffuse, transgress to increase" (Bacot & Canonne, 2019) This transgression can be thought of as the dispersal of the record into clubs which played a pivotal part in the dissemination of sound.

2.1. Time-binding records and the twisted wheel

The role of records as archival artefacts is underlined by Sarah Thornton as she notes "The time-binding power of records fosters interest not only in the novel, but in the archival. Records expedite cultural revival" (Thornton, 1995, p. 111) by transcending time and place, as well as creating sonic third spaces that encourage identity formation as the past is performed via kinesthetic movement. My suggestion is that physical spaces (see Mercieca, 2017) such as The Twisted Wheel and pilgrimage routes (see Hollows & Milestone, 1998) perform(ed) the same purpose. Similarly, social media serves this function whilst fostering a DIY archival culture online. Specifically, digital replicas of The Twisted Wheel on platforms and the manipulation of tools such as hashtags behave as capacitors for time-bending and binding, acting as sites of archival and cultural revival. This is achieved by democratising materials of cultural significance which in turn disperses power/ knowledge which is an integral factor in Northern Soul communities. By hacking many properties and allowing users to remix/hack culture, identities converge whilst time, space and ideologies are compressed to fraternize freely as digital clubs of the past.

One of these clubs known as The Twisted Wheel was a Blues and R&B club in Manchester that opened in 1963 by brothers Jack, Phillip, and Ivor Abadi. It was initially located on Brazenose Street, however in 1965, it moved to a new premise at Whitworth Street. Being one of the first clubs to play Northern Soul, it gained popularity from a faithful following that also came to hear its exclusive songs played by DJs such as Roger Eagle at all-nighters that ran from Saturday 11pm to Sunday 7.30am. It functioned as a coffee bar and dance club, whilst not serving alcohol to overcome restrictive alcohol licensing laws that affected opening hours of clubs. However, it was subsequently closed due to a new council bylaw that prohibited venues to stay open more than 2 hours into the following day. Similarly, other clubs that historically facilitated all-nighters followed a pattern of closure (loss), and replacement (substitution). The reincarnation of The Twisted Wheel from venue to venue and then online, along with its bypassing of laws and power are a microcosm of Northern

Soul activity that will be addressed as I examine its existence on Instagram.

The clusters of specific club themed groups on Facebook and Instagram reveal a deep connection to these sites and the memories they hold. Raine and Wall note "many of these online groups are dedicated to memorializing venues now lost to car parks and council development" (Raine & Wall, 2019, p. 158). This process of loss and memorial form the analysis of my data as I examine how DIY archival practices deal with loss by hacking and remixing the past to form digital shrines online.

3. Instagram as a city of the living dead

In between confinement and social media, I noted as an academic; admiration of members abilities to synthesize technology and customs; and as a follower of the music, appreciation as my black heritage was celebrated. I also perceived Instagram as a digital city inhabited by one billion members with their respective profile pages representing their digital abode. Clubs, past and present also constituted addresses whilst images were uploaded to adorn these digital habitats. Naturally this horizon of thought extended to Northern Soul and the position upon which it now lies situated between offline and online worlds, as well as how users act as architects of digital cities.

Joseph Roach's 'Cities of the Dead: Circum-Atlantic Performance' (1996) provided me with a basis upon which I could theorise how members were forming online, as well as archiving, hacking, and remixing. Roach's analysis of London and New Orleans from the 1800s examines how black Atlantic culture has ebbed and flowed within these respective regions. In doing so he suggests the fragments of black culture and traditions within these spaces are reviewed, remembered, practiced, performed, re-enacted and ultimately substitutions are created to fill the void of this loss. The process of surrogation and performance of black Atlantic culture within these spaces consists of the *loss* of culture, or entity within culture being replaced by a *surrogate*. In turn the *memory* of the lost tradition or character is *performed* with the hope that these *substitutes* can fill the void of loss as they perform identity and memory (see Roach, 1996). Potentially this process is driven by Roach's reflection that by excavating the past, "we can account for how we got here" (as well as conceive) "alternatives to our present condition" (Roach, 1993, p. 44).

The void of loss that Northern Soul theoretically fills is not overlooked; alternatively, it is proposed as a point of interest for future studies. However, by conceptualising Instagram as a city of the living and dead it is possible to perceive the loss and surrogation of sites such as The Twisted Wheel occurring. Moreover, by synthesizing Roach's key constituents of surrogation with the actions of DIY archival practices on Instagram, my data analysis suggests remix and hacking practices also occurring. Additionally, black Atlantic culture in the form of Jean-Michel Basquiat is used to reflect on the use of imagery within Instagram. To begin with I will examine how the #Twistedwheel has become a digital surrogate for its physical counterpart and the manifestation of memory, performance, and substitution that fills cavities of loss.

3.1. Remixing memory and graffiti in the city

Physical spaces such as The Twisted Wheel are lost, yet remembered, as images, posters, flyers, and murals within user's accounts and the city of Instagram. Within images of The Twisted Wheel, there is an interesting relationship between the accompanying text as I noted the images littered with graffiti, in the form of graffiti-hashtags related to Northern Soul. A contrasting process included images of Northern Soul related paraphernalia tagged with the #Twistedwheel. In fact, #Twistedwheel is used alongside a wide array of images ranging from record selling to promoting new events. Much like Jean-Michel Basquiat who 'used his tag, SAMO, to get a foothold into the burgeoning gallery scene on the Lower-East Side in the 1980s: "SAMO FOR THE ART PIMPS' (Thomas, 2015, p. n/p), Instagram users potentially tag images of #Twistedwheel to get a foothold into their respective sound cultures.

Hashtags work as iconotexts by combining and indicating cultural topics, as well as themes and in doing so they are participatory which represents "an important innovation in social media communication" (Saxton et *al.*, 2015, p. 156). This participation occurs due to hashtags functioning as decentralised user led communication systems. As a result, hashtags improve searchability and allow groups "to link messages to existing knowledge and action communities" (Saxton et *al.,* 2015, p. 156) which underpins its proliferation in community use.

Through the presence of the surrogate #Twistedwheel there is the desire or innate need to remember what is lost by distributing images and hashtags of the venue, which highlights how physical and digital spaces function as repositories of memory. "Roach names these spaces 'behavioral vortexes' as they perpetuate identities and modes of behaviour" (Hill,

2012, p. 182). Instagram as a behavioural vortex allows the restoration of behaviour via graffiti-hashtags of the #Twistedwheel which act as cultural self-invention (see Roach, 1996, p. 28) or self-documentation through the remixing of images of the lost venue with hashtags of the present. As a result, this empowers members to insert the past into the present. Similarly, members remix old images of the #Twistedwheel and varying contemporary hashtags or counter-memories such as #blackmusicians, #blackpower, #blacksingers, #blackmusic, #blacks, alongside #60sgirl, #miniskirt, #englishgirl.

Although previous collective memories such as widespread reports of drug use in clubs such as The Twisted Wheel (see Wilson, 2007) dominated previous narratives, they are no longer referenced within the images I sampled. Furthermore, Barry Doyle's (2005) observation of predominantly white, working class, homosocial activity that occurred in spaces such as The Twisted Wheel are now levered with counter-memories of ethnic minorities and women using the #Twistedwheel to assert prominence online as their histories are increasingly included. Additionally, there is widespread celebration of black artists that never performed at the venue via images and record sleeves tagged with the #Twistedwheel. By using the surrogate #Twistedwheel, counter-memories expose the disparities between master narratives of history and lived history. They challenge and distort via the public re-enactment of memory, while archives allow us to participate in this remix of memory. Ultimately, engaging with counter-memories via the use of surrogate hashtags, enables narratives to be questioned.

Vito Campanelli's (2014) observation of remix culture indicates how it can be synthesised with our understanding of social media usage; "the use of the term 'remix' refers to an irreversible process of hybridization of sources, materials, subjectivities, and media ongoing in contemporary society" (Campanelli, 2014, p. 68) whilst being "characterized by the prevalence of the participatory over the contemplative" (Campanelli, 2014, p. 70) which extends to DIY collaboration. Moreover, "Full immersion in remix culture can only be achieved through participating in the act of remixing" (Campanelli, 2014, p. 70). As bricoleurs they function in "a system, such as the present one, in which social rooting presupposes the repetition of signs. The contemporary bricoleur (the remixer) is part of the flow and thus promotes its unstoppable flowing" (Campanelli, 2014, p. 75).

3.2. Hacking performance with keys and portals to the city

After reviewing how hashtag-graffiti function as iconotexts and surrogates that enable memory, I identified the hashtag as a feature that becomes more than a visual tool. The #Twistedwheel is used to perform excitement over new events, songs, books, clothing by time-binding new performances to the past. Similarly, Basquiat drew upon 'cultural memory' to mix "together fragments of past and present, creating a unique style of painting, based upon his own experiences of contemporary American life blended with a remembering of an African past" (Ross, 2018, p. 6). The hashtag-graffiti that adorn the images now become hashtag-portals, functioning as flyers and invitations. With sufficient digital literacy and cultural underground knowledge, you can search key words as opposed to relying on their placement in text and images. By acting as portals, hashtags maintain cohesiveness in the sound culture as members are included in these invitation portals.

Subsequently, "Social tagging on Instagram leads to the generation of a folksonomy, that is a collaborative, collective, and social organization, at the metadata level, of information entered by users" (Ibba et al., 2015, p. 279). As a result, the hashtag forms new, and reintroduces old ideologies or collective movements within social media sites. As the surrogate Twisted Wheel is used as a portal amongst varying images, it provides a gateway to a collective performance of memory and ideologies that provokes excitement, nostalgia, and semiotic awareness.

Roach's genealogies of performance appear in his analysis of New Orleans Mardi Gras surrogates such as King Rex and King Zulu who maintain tradition and performance although their roles are played by new bodies annually (see, Hill, 2012, p. 177). Surrogates such as the #Twistedwheel are used as genealogies of performance in a similar way flyers or posters acted as promotion and invitations to clubs in the past. Both serve as performances of invitation, as portals to a club and in this sense they "consist of a set of actions that hold open a place in memory" (Roach, 1996, p. 36). This is partly achieved by 'retagging' old images which, as a form of re-distribution creates new meanings of images and reconfigures memories. However, the authenticity of hashtags as digital surrogates may be questioned as their use cannot be contained, which has implications for boundary maintenance and authenticity of the representation of the #Twistedwheel. Northern Soul members are acutely aware of authenticity which has implications for the potential mainstream/ commercial usage and outsider tagging of the #Twistedwheel as it becomes a tool to be manipulated in many performances.

The transmission and dissemination of cultural practices through collective representations can also take the form of archival performances. As offline performances are repeated or reperformed they are remembered through the body as living memory, subsequently recorded, and archived as memory. Additionally, we are increasingly viewing the present through performances that are archived immediately, as a result the connection between deep memory and recent memory is blurred. However, as genealogies of performance reiterate the past, as well as influence the future, they also cast doubt on their own authenticity in the present. This is noted with progressive and nostalgic disagreement over style, customs, music, and the direction of Northern Soul. Because performances are archived for all to see, authenticity of progressive clubs that apply #Twistedwheel to images are the focus of intense scrutiny.

By hacking the past in new interpretive ways and re-tagging old memories with new meaning, a form of palimpsest memory performance (see Silverman, 2015) occurs. The abundance of Northern Soul members globally adds to this varied performance that blends old with new. It is a progressive performance, imitating the past, filling the void of loss with imagined and new progressive memories from their respective cultures. Members reach out to each other with varying hashtags, thus creating performance movements within the sound culture that capture the essence of the moment and enactment of the past such as #BLM and #SkinheadReggae, both of which are at odds with dominant notions of the original venue yet have features and links to the past. The connection between DIY, hacking practises and hashtag performance can be conceptualised with Baptiste Bacot and Clément Canonne's (2019) observation:

> *the concepts of DIY - understood as the use of roundabout means to achieve an end that we have set ourselves -, of improvisation - understood as spontaneous and creative adaptation to the unpredictability of its environment - , of diversion - understood as a displacement that is at the same time practical, contextual and semiotic - or of poaching - understood as an act of resistance by individuals within consumer societies - obviously retain all their relevance in qualifying the "hacking" practices of the era (Bacot & Canonne, 2019, p. 11).

3.3 Algorithms, substitutes and the architecture of the city of hashtags

After viewing the graffiti in the city and then using the keys to the city, you are taken to a place largely beyond algorithmic control, to the digital city below. Here, hashtags are no longer graffiti or the keys to the city, they are the city, with each hashtag representing shrines, buildings, and effigies. Moreover, they form an underground community or "subnetwork of densely connected nodes" (whilst the genre specific hashtags) "of a community are more connected to each other if compared to nodes that are outside the community" (Ibba et al., 2015, p. 281). The densely populated community and nodes reflect the densely populated city of one billion users, therefore "we could associate cities to nodes, and roads connecting cities to branches" (Ibba, Orrù, Pani & Porru, 2015, p. 281). Basquiat's use of graffiti, yet asserting they are paintings, alongside his friendship with Andy Warhol in the counterculture movement reflects how Otherness can complicate our view of spheres whilst underlining how people as nodes connect and restructure disparate nodes in society. Northern Soul similarly builds connections that perplex and confuse categorisation as it mirrors Basquiat by revealing "a postmodern appropriation and reinterpretation of diverse cultural elements into a single Creole, or multi-ethnic identity" (Ross, 2018, p. 3)

Within the digital city of architecture(d)-hashtags, user led architects have designed digital monuments consisting of artists, songs, ideologies, memories, and temporal spaces each with their own digital shrine full of archives. For example, if you were to search for the #Twistedwheel on Instagram, or to click on this graffiti and enter the portal you are presented with a front-loading page that looks like an individual users' account that is not controlled by anyone other than the domain owners who may remove content that circumvents their rules and guidelines. It is possible to 'follow' these pages, which then allows you to receive images into your newsfeed just as you would if you followed a person. However, the images are an amalgamation of all other users' images that have used this hashtag. Consequently, it becomes a digital club, a network of people much like the all-nighter events it hosted in the past full of members that share a common purpose without interference. This is an inclusive DIY approach to spatial design that stretches the limitations of the architecture of Instagram provided to members. As a result, participatory cultures online are collaborating via the use of technology and software to create networked architecture within social media sites that suits their needs.

Although "The purpose of the hashtag is to categorize topics, to combine ideas, to encourage exchanges

and joining" (Fedushko et *al.*, 2019, p. 1) they also allow agency as "posts with hashtags in social networks are not regulated" (Fedushko et *al.*, 2019, p. 1). This is a page largely free of algorithm control with a myriad of collective member led rooms below the city above. The content that is found here can be thought of as an un-visible sub-page full of users' images, audio-visual content and text that pertain to that hashtag. As a DIY tool this circumvents newsfeed control, so you see what you want. Because these spaces overcome algorithm control, they are DIY tools of resistance that embody time, space, and ideologies. Additionally, they serve as underground spaces whilst being in a highly visible environment online, where privacy is contested, and information is harvested to provide algorithms with more power.

Substitution of The Twisted Wheel reflects replication of its physical form of the club with many members entering and contributing to its archive of memories. These archival performances or re-enactments create layers of doubling which in turn cast doubt on what is authentic as their proximity to loss and memory is shrouded in suspicion. Substitution, or surrogation is never achieved. The genealogy of performance is forever seeking the imagined past of black culture and indeed the imagined past of Northern working-class England and the special qualities of The Twisted Wheel. Moreover, digitizing does not guarantee acceptance as Northern Soul has conspicuously rejected CD and digital turntables over vinyl. As rejected substitutes arise in the form of new technologies there is negotiation on which technologies serve as substitutes. The lack of authenticity that the substitute possesses is also negotiated, whilst the way it performs memory and identity is applauded.

User led architecture in the form of hashtags act as a counter to algorithms and the realities of how "these new vital and intelligent power structures are on the inside of our everyday lives" (Beer, 2009, p. 995). Nick Seaver (2021) observes "As the influence of algorithmic systems has grown, critics have come to appreciate that algorithms are not autonomous technical forces, but rather heterogeneous sociotechnical systems" (Seaver, 2021, p. 771). Furthermore, Elise Morrison, Tavia Nyong'o and Joseph Roach's (2019) contemporary perspective to the issue of performance online prompts the question if performance is for the construction of an effigy or alternatively, is performance for algorithms that have subconsciously shaped how we remember and perform memory? Instagram's algorithms heavily influence what is seen on newsfeeds which results in individuals performing to be seen as they covet likes and views. The implications this has on culture as it is shaped by algorithms is a techno pessimistic dystopia where culture, memory and performance are shaped by algorithms.

However, the strength in the digital surrogate of the #Twistedwheel is its agency. Much like the physical Twisted Wheel applying a non-alcoholic service to circumvent licensing laws to stay open later, the digital hashtag allows users to overcome algorithmic control online. This subversive nature of Northern Soul occupies a space within hacktivism whilst hashtags are potentially a subconscious reaction to an un-visible force (algorithms) that users are not aware of. Moreover, perhaps the acceptance of the #Twistedwheel, as a substitute, fulfils archiving, remixing and DIY grassroots participation on a collective scale that provides mass agency and resistance which is fundamental to Northern Soul members.

4. Conclusion

One of the intentions of this discussion was to push the boundaries of (ethno?)musicological methodologies by embracing digital environments and big data. In doing so there is the possibility of democratising ethnographic data collection by hearing voices that may never be heard otherwise. Moreover, my intent on viewing Northern Soul culture through the prism of Roach, and incorporating black Atlantic theorem into Northern Soul alongside Basquiat is a method of reflecting on the broad culture that is applicable to myself as well as Soul music. By drawing on our experience's, researchers add to the rich tapestry of knowledge of sound cultures whilst also reflecting on our environment. As I examined my data and probed the archives of Instagram such visual references, structural concepts and self-reflexive moments became a necessity, however there are more questions and suggestions than answers beyond the scope of this paper.

Progressive Northern Soul members that are creating and consuming new music, challenging nostalgic perceptions of the sound culture along with an international contingent provide much source of analysis. Accordingly, to what extent do these groups rely on technology? Furthermore, the role of social media platforms and their varying uses and respective architecture is a fundamental direction to explore but to what extent does the DIY nature of members create and shape their spheres within these environments? Visual analysis of sound cultures whilst demanding, is also a significant spectre as memory and temporal studies are increasingly undertaken, however what methods are researchers applying to the relationship

between sound, time, memory, and images? Moreover, the (un)visible nature of algorithms presents one of the most foreboding points of study that requires partnership with members of the sound culture to reveal this quiet power. As a result, what direction are Northern Soul members taking to overcome online control?

During this discussion, I have suggested connections between theoretical frameworks; however, like Basquiat, Northern Soul is all of these yet none at the same time. Alternatively, it presents facets of hacker culture and some semblance of remix culture as DIY tools in an un(knowing) way which has led researchers to decipher its motives unendingly.

References

» Wall, T. (2006). Out on the floor: The politics of dancing on the northern soul scene. Popular Music, *25*(3), 431.

» Bacot, B. & Canonne, C. (2019). Music and *hacking*: from ethics to practices. *Volume! 16*(1). https://doi.org/10.4000/volume.7211

» Beer, D. (2009). Power through the algorithm? Participatory web cultures and the technological unconscious. *New Media & Society*, *11*(6), 985-1002.

» Campanelli, V. (2014) *Toward a Remix Culture.* In Navas, E., Gallagher, O. & Burrough, X. (Eds.). *The Routledge Companion to Remix Studies.* Abingdon: Routledge

» Doyle, B. (2005). More than a dance hall, more a way of life: Northern Soul masculinity and working class culture in 1970s Britain. In A. Schildt & D. Siegfried (Eds.). *Between Marx and Coca-Cola: Youth cultures in changing European societies 1960-1980*. Oxford: Berghahn.

» Fedushko, S., Syerov, Y. & Kolos, S. (2019). Hashtag as a Way of Archiving and Distributing Information on the Internet. In M. Emmerich; V. Lytvyn; I. Yevseyeva; V. Basto-Fernandes; D. Dosyn & V. Vysotska. (Eds.). *Modern Machine Learning Technologies and Data Science*. (pp. 274-286). *MoMLet&DS-2019.*

» Fusch, P. & Ness, L. (2015). Are We There Yet? Data Saturation in Qualitative Research. *The Qualitative Report, 20*(9), 1408-1416.

» Guest, G., Bunce, A. & Johnson, L. (2006). How Many Interviews Are Enough?: An Experiment with Data Saturation and Variability. *Field Methods*, *18*(1), 59–82.

» Hill, S. (2012). Ghostly Surrogates and Unhomely Memories: Performing the Past in Marina Carr's Portia Coughlan. *Études Irlandaises*, *37*(1), 173-187.

» Hollows, J. & K., Milestone (1998). Welcome to Dreamsville: A history and geography of northern soul. In A. Leyshon; D. Matless & G. Revill (Eds.). *The place of music*. London: Guilford Press.

» Ibba, S., Orrù, M., Pani, F. E. & Porru, S. (2015). Hashtag of Instagram: From Folksonomy to Complex Network. In A.L.N. Fred; J. L. G. Dietz; D. Aveiro; K. Liu & J. Filipe (Eds.). *KEOD.* (pp. 279-284). SCITEPRESS – Science and Technology Publications.

» Kozinets, R. (2019). *Netnography: The Essential Guide to Qualitative Social Media Research*. London, Thousand Oaks, New Delhi, Singapore: SAGE.

» Lessig, L. (2008). *Remix: Making Art and Commerce Thrive in a Hybrid Economy*. New York: Penguin Press

» Mercieca, P.D. (2017). Southern' Northern Soul: Changing Senses of Direction, Place, Space, Identity and Time. *M/C Journal*, *20*(6). https://doi.org/10.5204/mcj.1361

» Morrison, E., Nyong'o, T, & Roach, J. (2019). Algorithms and Performance: An Introduction. *TDR/The Drama Review/ 63*(4) (244), 8–13.

» Raine, S. & Wall. T. (2017). Participation and Role in the Northern Soul Scene. In P. Guerra, & T. Moreira, (Eds.) *Keep It Simple, Make It Fast!: An Approach to Underground Music Scenes* (pp.75–86). Porto: Faculdade de Letras da Universidade do Porto.

» Roach, J. (1993). Carnival and the Law in New Orleans. *TDR (1988-)*, *37*(3), 42–75.

» Roach, J.R. (1996). *Cities of the Dead: Circum-Atlantic Performance*. New York: Columbia University Press.

» Ross, L. (2018). *Gold Griot: Jean-Michel Basquiat Telling (His) Story in Art*. Plymouth: University of Plymouth.

» Saxton, G.D., Niyirora, J., Guo, C. & Waters, R.D. (2015). #AdvocatingForChange: The Strategic Use of Hashtags in Social Media Advocacy. *Advances in social work, 16*, 154-169.

» Seaver, N. (2021). Seeing like an infrastructure: avidity and difference in algorithmic recommendation. *Cultural Studies, 35*(4-5), 771-791.

» *Silverman, M. (2015) Palimpsestic Memory: The Holocaust and Colonialism in French and Francophone Fiction and Film* [Berghahn on Film]. Oxford: Berghahn.

» Thomas, A. (2015, December 22). 8 Quotes From Jean-Michel Basquiat on What Would Be His 55th Birthday. *Artnet*. Retrieved from: https://news.artnet.com/art-world/jean-michel-basquiat-55th-birthday-394776

» Thornton, S. (1995). *Club Cultures: Music, Media, and Subcultural Capital*. Oxford: Polity Press.

» Wall. T. & Raine, S. (2019) Myths on/of the northern soul scene. In S. Rain; N. Smith & T. Wall (Eds.). *The northern soul scene* (pp. 142-163). Sheffield: Equinox Publishing.

» Wilson, A. (2007). *Northern Soul*. London: Willan.